



**Education and Home Affairs Panel**  
**Jersey Music Service Review Hearing with the**  
**Minister for Education, Sport and Culture**

**FRIDAY, 19th APRIL 2013**

**Panel:**

Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour (Chairman)  
Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade  
Connétable M.P.S. Le Troquer of St. Martin

**Witnesses:**

Deputy P.J.D. Ryan of St. John (The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture)  
Mr. C. Chipperfield (Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture)  
Ms. T. Mourant (Executive Officer, Education, Sport and Culture)  
Dr. G. Cox (Head of Service, Jersey Music Service)

**Key issues**

<b>What are the key proposals in instituting this change?</b>	<b>page 2</b>
<b>What are the current limitations of the service?</b>	<b>page 5</b>
<b>What has happened in other authorities when charges have been introduced?</b>	<b>page 6</b>
<b>How to make the service more inclusive?</b>	<b>page 7</b>
<b>How do charging systems operate in the UK?</b>	<b>page 12</b>
<b>How will the Bursary Scheme work?</b>	<b>page 17</b>
<b>What consultation has taken place?</b>	<b>page 26</b>

[12:19]

**Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour (Chairman):**

Good afternoon, everyone. Welcome to this hearing of the Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel. We have of course examined the presentation and we would also like to thank the department for the presentation that they put before States Members earlier on in the week. This is to examine the proposals and also to provide extra information for States Members before the debate, which will be occurring in a couple of weeks. So if I can start by asking if the Minister could outline the key proposals in instituting this change.

**What are the key proposals in instituting this change?**

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Okay, thank you, and good morning, everyone. This proposal for introducing charges for the Jersey Instrumental Music Service has its roots many years ago. It has been talked about and thought about I think for in excess of 5 years. It culminated in the debate in 2010 for the 2011 Business Plan, which was driven to some extent by Comprehensive Spending Review implications and the States agreed at that time that it would be appropriate to introduce charges for instrumental music for the 2011 budget in 2010, when the discussion on the 2011 Business Plan took place. Since that time, the department has been working on the various options for introducing those charges, and after much deliberation, we are proposing that we introduce charges in 2 phases. To start with, we want to introduce charges in 2013, September 2013, for any enhancements and new service developments that we feel we would like to offer in some way to test the market, to see what the market for different services is, and any other ways to start to develop the service to reach more children. That is in 2013. Charges for the existing services that we currently offer will be delayed until September 2014. So in essence, that is where we are. I should explain that at the moment, the Jersey Music Service is a free service. What it will become, if our proposals are accepted finally by the States, is a heavily subsidised service. It will be nowhere near full cost recovery and the budget from the department to the Jersey Music Service will still be in excess of £500,000 a year. Nevertheless, it will have reduced from the something like £725,000 a year that it currently is, and that will therefore make a £200,000 saving that we are committed to make, and in fact have already lost on our budgets - the overall department budget - of £200,000 per annum.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Can I just say something? Before we go too far into it then can you explain, please, the instrumental service, because this was in the media last night and Channel TV, but it is not all music?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

It should be made absolutely clear that music is a fundamental part of the Jersey curriculum.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Throughout the schools?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Throughout the schools.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Secondary and junior?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

That is not affected in any way, shape or form. We need to clearly put this one to bed.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

So that happens during the school day?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

It happens during the school day as part of the primary school curriculum and all schools have to follow that primary school curriculum. We are not talking about any changes at all to that service, that part of the Jersey primary school curriculum, the music lessons that all children have. We are only talking about the extracurricular, the non-statutory part of music tuition that parents optionally choose to take as well, and at the moment are getting for free.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

When do they do this, at night or Saturdays, weekends?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

They do it after school hours, after normal school hours. Perhaps you would like to explain.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Yes, surely. This is extra to the Jersey curriculum, and as the Minister quite rightly says, there is a curricular requirement in both primary and secondary schools for music, classroom music, as we refer to it. The service offers instrumental lessons, it teaches instruments during the school day, so the children come out of various activities to take their lessons and the service also offers additional things like bands and orchestras and instrumental loans and those sorts of things.

Bands and orchestras happen outside of the school day, so they happen in the evenings and weekends and times like that.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Outside of what the Jersey Instrumental Music Service does is outside of the normal music curriculum.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

It is not part of the curriculum.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

It is not part of the curriculum.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

But it could be if we had a different system, and I am sure there are jurisdictions where it is part of the statutory provision.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

I am not sure if individual is part of it.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Not in the U.K. (United Kingdom). There are jurisdictions around the world where it is part of their curriculum, but not in the U.K. No.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Can you just confirm, Minister, what are the motivations for these charges? What is the basis for them?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

The initial motivation to examine in great depth what the Jersey Instrumental Music Service does was driven by the C.S.R. (Comprehensive Spending Review) but it became clear to me pretty rapidly when I started to look at it that there were opportunities through a charging system to both make a C.S.R. saving, but also - and importantly - to enhance the system, to broaden its operation and to develop it in an entrepreneurial manner. I think we need to say "in an entrepreneurial manner", I think that is important to understand.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So you have got a tough task in one sense where everyone is feeling the pinch, the parents with their private or non-private schools have probably got less money in their pockets at the moment, and you are hoping that by charging them £55 initially per student per term that there is going to be more people taking up the service. Is that a bit of a conundrum?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

It could be looked at as a bit of a conundrum, yes, but I think that we need to look at the experience of what has happened over the past decade with music services throughout the United Kingdom and lots of other places, and I will ask Graham to just expand on that.

**What are the current limitations of the service?**

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Surely, yes. I think it is fair to say that the current system is not available to everyone in the sense that we have a limited resource and it is not unusual on an annual basis, as we offer the services to new children, that we have to turn away as many as 50 per cent of people that want to do it, because we simply do not have the resource to meet that demand. We are also limited in the sort of thing that we can offer to young people. We currently teach orchestral instruments, but as you are probably aware, many young people want to learn instruments other than the traditional orchestral instruments and because of the way we are structured, essentially funded core grant, we are not able to broaden to meet that. So we have certain issues that we need to address as a service if we are going to be there for all children, and what this model does is it allows us to expand to meet the need. Although it sounds a little bit contradictory a statement, with close examination, it does become obvious. Do you want me to briefly explain how it might work in order that we could offer it to more children? I think the important thing to say is that no child should be excluded because of financial concerns, and we have tried to build in all the structures we can to ensure that that does not happen, that no child should miss out because parents cannot afford the cost of the lessons.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

At the moment, you say you get 500 maybe per annum apply, and who do they apply to? Who is the application made to?

[12:30]

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

It is made to the service.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

What comprises the Jersey Instrumental Service then? I mean, is it a group of individuals who are music teachers or is it teachers at the school?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

No, it is a group of teachers who are employed by the Education Department.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Who are employed by them?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Yes, and form the service. We have about 15 fulltime teachers and then half a dozen who work part-time with us. They provide the teaching in the schools, so about this time of year, we go around the primary schools and we show them the instruments and what it is all about et cetera and then a handout, an application form for the parents to complete, which comes into our office. But each year we get far more applications than we have time and resource to deliver lessons to, so then we have to go through a process of selecting which children to take and which children not to take.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

So the proposition itself, there is like the indication that because there are so many on the waiting list that all the spaces ... because some parents will probably withdraw their children, thinking that they cannot afford it, so the 200 or 300 that do not have places, you are thinking that will happen, that they will get a place so you will still have the same amount of youngsters although they will be paying for the service.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

My experience has been that you do not get the sort of withdrawals that we are fearing. I mean, compared to private teaching, this is a very reasonable price. It compares very favourably and I think it is also very important that we have in place all the mechanisms to ensure that no child has to give up simply because their parents feel they cannot afford the lessons.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

I think it would be quite useful for the record, Graham, if you explained in your experience and what your experience is, so if you can ...

**What has happened in other authorities when charges have been introduced?**

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Sure, sure. This will be the third or fourth time that I have been through this particular process and it is worrying for people because it is a huge, huge change. Most of the U.K. services went through this about 15 years ago and I was managing in the U.K. at the time. The combined experience of all the services - because obviously a lot of research was done around the time, collecting numbers - and how things worked was that in the initial first year of introduction, there was a reduction in the number of children applying for lessons and the national experience was about a 3 to 5 per cent drop in numbers applying for lessons. The experience then going forward over the next medium to long term, 3 to 5 years, was that the numbers grew greatly. In some cases, services doubled in size as new people came. The 200 or 300 that you have to turn away suddenly had a mechanism to access the system and they came into it, so that was the national experience in the U.K. and that was certainly my personal experience in the services that I was working at the time.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Can I just come in there? So that we are comparing apples with apples and not apples with pears, can you just tell us with the change, the report into the U.K., what type of safeguards were included into those systems as well?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Yes, it obviously varied from authority to authority in detail, and indeed, in terms of what groups they were seeking to protect, but almost invariably if parents were in receipt of any sort of benefits, then they received free lessons. Most services offered some sort of bursary scheme so that parents who were above that line were able to access lessons. As I say, that is just a general picture. With the 142 services or whatever there are in the U.K. there were obviously different models in use, but most put in place mechanisms to ensure that nobody missed out.

**How to make the service more inclusive?**

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Can I just ask, what I do not understand is how you will know that those parents who are not taking up the lessons, who do not fall in the income support bracket, so who do not qualify anyway, they will not necessarily come forward and tell the department: "Look, I am not taking up lessons for my child because now I have to pay for it. We do not have the disposable income." They simply will be below the radar and my concern is that in a similar way that people do not go to the doctor because they cannot afford the fee, my concern is that these parents will be completely unknown about and that they will not be able to be included in the figures. What provisions are there ...

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

I think Graham can probably answer how he will pick up or believes that he will pick up those, that group, but in the interests of comparing apples with pears, our research shows us that the levels of charges that were introduced in the United Kingdom where you had the 3 to 5 per cent drop in the initial period and then it expanded et cetera, we think that we are comparing apples with apples in terms of our protection of those on income support, apples and apples with the U.K. bursary scheme, but not apples with apples in terms of our charging structure and levels. Apples with grapes, because the size of the fruit that we are charging - proposing to charge - Jersey families is in many cases significantly less than is being charged in the U.K. and in most cases it is less.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Are they seedless grapes or ...

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

They are smaller, smaller than an apple.

**Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

I think the analogy has lost me now.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

We were going to move on to this point, but now that you have raised it, what we would like to ask is we have looked at some of the examples, so the Scottish examples where fees can vary quite substantially, from £95 to £340, that is the annual charge, but what I am wondering is what is included within that? So presumably ... we would like to quantify what that is.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

We are kind of one question behind Deputy Maçon, because I do not think Graham has answered the question from Deputy Tadier about how he envisages that we will find those families that fall out.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Yes, please continue.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Is that okay?

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

I will catch up.



**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

I think it is a very valid point, and I think it is something that we are very conscious of. I think currently it is a change of culture and it is a change of approach. I think currently we are very conscious that we have a limited resource and we have a lot of people who wish to access it, and that is not just parents. Each year we are faced with having to tell several hundred parents that we are unable to take them on and that is difficult. We also have the same pressure from schools, who want to develop their music within the schools and are obviously reliant on a service like ours to produce young instrumentalists, who put us under a similar pressure. So I think all of our structures are geared up to not ... I was going to say not encouraging, are geared up to ensure that we do not have too many people trying to access the service. That is the way we are structured. We select where we do demonstrations, because we know we have only got enough resource to go into particular schools. We are very careful in our negotiations with schools what sort of expectations we raise in them, because we know we cannot deliver the resource. I think when you move into this sort of environment, you move into an environment where you have got to think very carefully about how do we ensure that every child can make an informed choice? I think currently it is not necessarily an informed choice. I think it is a choice that is often led by the school or the parent, the type of parent that has come through music education themselves or learnt an instrument and they attend a school where that sort of thing is a very positive thing to be doing. We do not actively do anything other than work to those expectations, because we do not have the resource to step outside that. I think there is a whole thing about the work that is done before you ask a child to make the decision and there are lots of very good examples of work going on in the U.K. and in other countries about you give young people the experience of playing an instrument before they have to opt to play one, how you can give them the experience of playing different types of instrument. I do not mean we just sit them in a room and have a go on everything, I mean a properly structured course where they know they want to play a woodwind instrument or they want to play a double wind instrument because they have had an experience that has told them that is what they want to do. I think if you are approaching it from that respect, rather than trying to hold back the flood, as it were, you address some of those issues, but I think it is something that if we move down this road, we have got to monitor very carefully and make sure we are putting the right things in place.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

How do you currently select from your waiting list? I mean, what kind of criteria would you use?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

What happens is we target the recruitment concerts very much in terms of the resource that we have got available, so if we know we have, let us say, for example, a string teacher that will have X amount of time available next year, we will target a number of schools that may be able to fill that

time up. We would then go in and do what we call a recruitment concert, where the string teacher will go in and show off the string instruments, then forms and information are handed out to the children. Parents send those back into us and then we do a series of what we describe as taster sessions where the teacher that would be delivering the lessons will sit down with you, and it can be a very large group who return the forms, and they will have a couple of lessons - a couple of periods of time in the school, rather than lessons with the children - letting them have a go, showing them various techniques and that sort of thing. I know that at the end of that process, the teacher has to sit down and think who is most likely to benefit from this and turn out to be a good instrumentalist. So that is the process.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Just a couple of things before we move on too much further, and I am sorry I missed the presentation this week, but being in 2 places at the same time. On the other hand, this is a public hearing, so it does give the media the chance to listen in to what may have happened in the meeting. I am just thinking, you are reducing £200,000, so it is a lot of money you have to make up before you start offering new services, so I do not see how. What new services can you offer, because you have still got to find that shortfall, the existing £200,000.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

At the moment, there is a financial constraint on the resources and how much music tuition can be offered by the service. There is a financial constraint at the moment, driven by its budget of £725,000-ish a year. When you reduce to £500,000-ish, in excess of £500,000, your overheads, your fixed costs are still covered, so to a great extent, pretty much completely your financial constraints of expanding the service disappear because you are not going to increase your core overheads and things like that. It is only then really constrained by 2 things. It is constrained by the availability of the number of qualified teachers that you can find locally to deliver lessons and it is constrained by the market itself at the other side, in other words, how many families and children want to take part. That is why you have seen in the U.K. sometimes where the music service has doubled in size when you go through this process.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Sorry, the cost of a teacher delivering a lesson to a group of children, it is hugely greater than the salary costs of that teacher, but those actual central costs are constant. It is if you need a building, you need a building and it does not matter whether you are putting 15 teachers out or 30 teachers out. If you need to run performance management processes or all those sorts of things, that does not change, and similarly some of the more curriculum support roles we take on, like we have an advisory teacher for the curriculum and that sort of thing, again that is a core cost that stays the same. The actual cost of putting the teacher into the school, in terms of group teaching, would be

covered by these numbers, so it means that if there is a demand for an additional guitar teacher or just additional brass teacher or whatever it is to do a day's teaching in that school, the income generated from that teaching covers the salary costs and all the other costs are fixed.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Like last night, if I am a parent watching the television and I am going to read the newspaper Monday night or something like that before it is debated in the States in a couple of weeks, it will be the States blamed, will it not, that we are being charged for our children? It will not be the Education Department as such, it will be the States. The whole proposition relates to user-pays, and it is more so for the Minister. Have you got examples that the media can report on on other user-pays departments on services that are provided at the moment that they can compare it as a parent and think: "Oh, I am going to have to pay for additional lessons now"? You have cleared up the first part, saying they are still going to have music lessons. I understand that.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

That is not affected. I mean, it is not a full user-pays. It is a user subsidiser. I think that needs to be very clear, and probably more than 50 per cent subsidised. I do not have the actual number, but it is certainly ...

**Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

It will be about 63 per cent.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

So it is subsidised instrumental music as opposed to a free one, and a heavily subsidised one. The only examples I think that we could offer to parents in the States are the experience of the U.K. that have gone through this process in the past. What it will mean is that we can offer a much wider service and enhanced, with a wider choice of instruments, instruments that in many cases will be much more relevant to what children and parents are interested in in terms of music.

[12:45]

Let us be honest, in simple terms, any music is good; it does not matter what it is, it is good.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

I agree.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

At the moment, that is where we have a problem, because we cannot offer any music.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Can I just ask though, the problem that we are going to have in the States is that whichever way you dress this up, this is a regressive charge, because £55 a term going up, if you have got a small disposable income as a family unit, let us say you have got £500 disposable income a month, that is 10 per cent of your disposable income. If you are a millionaire and your child happens to be lucky enough to get this heavily subsidised service, I think it is about 70 per cent plus subsidised, the question then has to be asked, if you have got the lower level where you insulate those on income support, why do you not draw a cap and say: "We are going to take in as one of the factors" because presumably you will still have a waiting list initially: "if somebody has got £200,000 of income, why are they potentially taking a space from somebody who is a middle to low-income earner when they should be prioritised in that way?" These are the kind of potential amendments our Panel or States Members individually may be looking at.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

I think before we go on right to the bursary system, because I think that is something we would want ...

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

We are talking about the bursary system.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

It will be the bursary system, but before we do that, Deputy, if that is all right, I have got a few more questions for you.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Yes, and we can talk, we have got lots of information about the bursary.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Yes, we will go into the bursary system, that is a key one, but just before we do that, again, because we are still talking about the comparison between different jurisdictions, in your presentation you highlighted the differences between kind of the Jersey system, Isle of Wight, Kent and Brighton and West Sussex and we have also got the comparisons in the Scottish system as well. But what I wanted to get from the department is although the Jersey system is £55 for an individual lesson and a group lesson, in other jurisdictions they have a different range, but of course there is no information telling us what is offered in those other jurisdictions so that we can compare that we are getting a like for like system. I wonder if you could just advise upon what is offered in these other jurisdictions which would make up their costs compared to what we are being offered just so that we are confident in saying that they are comparable.

## How do charging systems operate in the UK?

### Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:

This was raised in the briefing session, as you say, and as I promised, I have found some more authorities to compare with, so there are more numbers. I can let you have that after this hearing. I think what it is worth saying is that in the U.K. currently there are, broadly speaking, 3 systems in operation, so comparing with some authorities is very difficult, but it is you are comparing apples and oranges. There are authorities that are using a similar system to the one we are talking about adopting, which is a charge to parents, and in that case it is very simple to make a comparison if they are talking about it in the same terms that we are. So, for example, we are talking about giving half-hour lessons to groups of children. If they are talking in those terms, that becomes a very easy comparison. Sometimes they are talking about 45-minute lessons with groups of 6 and then it becomes very difficult to make a comparison, but the other complication in this is that the other 2 systems in operation ... and particularly the comment was made at the briefing that a lot of these seem to be southern authorities. There seems to be a divide as you go up the country. It is not total and you will find different ways of behaving right across the country, but there seems to be 3 bands, and there seems to be the south of the U.K. operates direct charges to parents. The middle of the U.K. operates a system of charging schools, so they will charge for an instrumental teacher to visit a school at whatever the rate is an hour, and it is up to the school how much of that charge they choose to pass on to the parent, and obviously then it becomes very complicated because some schools subsidise it heavily; some schools have found sponsorship et cetera to make it completely free; some schools believe that they should be making a small mark-up on it, because they can invest that in that their own music department. So inside one city boundary, you can find all sorts of charges going on, so the service itself is making a charge to the school and the decision about charging parents is then the school's, so that is the second system. That tends to be around the middle of the country, but you will see other examples elsewhere. Then the third system is not to directly employ any teachers, but to keep a register of instrumental teachers within the authority and then the practice gets very variable. In some cases, it is simply a register. In some cases it is a register where there has been things like C.R.B. (Criminal Records Bureau) checks done and that sort of thing, and in some other cases, there are quality checks as well, but effectively you would ring the service and you would say: "We would like a guitar teacher" and you would be sent a list, a bit like a list of childminders, you would be sent a list of people that taught guitar in your area. That seems to be very prevalent in the north of the U.K., but yes, there are examples of it further down. So the reason there are so many comparatives with the South of England is because we are talking about a system that is very similar to the South of England, and I have now pulled off about 12 or 14 authorities that you can see the comparisons with. They vary from about £70 up to about £180 for a shared lesson; that is a termly charge.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

They do vary from zero, do they not, of course?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Since we last spoke and I said that as far as I was aware, there was no authority that was not charging, I have found one. West Lothian in Scotland do not charge.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I think we found 8 in Scotland. I am not sure if this information is up-to-date, but it says ...

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Yes. I mean, you may, yes, but I found West Lothian in Scotland.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So if you want to learn the bagpipes, probably go up there.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Okay, thank you, but it is just that caution that obviously things like the cost does change depending on if it is a half-hour session, 45 minutes, an hour's session.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Yes. If there is an instrument included in, there are all those things and they are all very variable packages.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

The fees that have been set in the paper, is that what will happen for the next 3 years or is there a chance that they would increase greater than what is in the proposition? Because you said September ...

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

We built in a 2.5 per cent rise in fees for each of the 3 years, so it is inflation or less than probable real inflation, but nevertheless ...

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

But that is set?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

That is in the charges.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

That is not likely to change in 2016, 2015?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

No. Well, what are they now, we are talking about ...

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Because people budget so far in advance.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

September 2014 is £55 - for the first child, I am talking about - September 2015 is £58 and September 2016 is £61, so those are fixed. I cannot tell you what would happen after that.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Just for the record then, the £55, what does that include?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

That is an instrumental lesson. That is every week that the school is in session that would include.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

So 30 minutes?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

A 30-minute shared lesson, yes.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

So it would not include things like the instrument?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

No.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

With the instrument, how does that get paid for?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

A lot of parents buy their own instrument and keep them and then sell them at the end maybe if the child stops playing, or Graham, there is a loan system.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Yes. We have a stock of instruments of variable and decreasing quality, which is one of the reasons we need to invest in the service to improve that stock, and they are available and we put a hire charge on those of £18 a term. There are also commercial hiring schemes that parents can access, which are between about £30 and £50 a term.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

It does not include books?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

No.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Exams?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Beg your pardon?

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Is there exams in part of the ...

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

There are musical exams, but they are not included in the cost. Parents have always paid for musical exams and books and that sort of thing.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

To get the grades?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

To get the grades, that is right, yes.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Just out of interest, what is Beaulieu and De La Salle? They are not included in ...

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

That is historic. I think you are probably best to answer that. I do not know.



**Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

Beaulieu and De La Salle Boys employ their own instrumental music teachers and run their own schemes.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

I have paid for 2 girls to go through. Yes, I understand that.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Our understanding is that the charges are considerably more.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

They are.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

So in fact parents at De La Salle and Beaulieu would be very happy with this new arrangement.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I do not know if you want to answer that previous question I ...

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

The one that Jeremy asked?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Yes, it was basically about the bursaries.

## **How will the Bursary Scheme work?**

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Yes, so if we can move on to the bursary system now. I wonder if you could just start with ... if you could just outline how you envisage the bursary system to work and then we can take it from there.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I mean, I am concerned about the fact that you are going to have parents on marginal incomes who are going to have to start paying, albeit what seems a modest fee, alongside people who have got the wherewithal to pay, they are going to receive the same subsidy.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

When we start talking about bursaries, is there a sub-text of why are we not means-testing? Is that part of the same question, because I can address both if you want.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Yes, I think so.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

That would probably save time. I have here a note which is very clear. I can read out some examples from it, but then we will give you this note in writing so effectively it will be a written submission as to why we do not think means-testing is appropriate. We have got a lot of experience in means-testing, because it is used for university grants, as I am sure you are aware. As a system, it is quite onerous, both for the States department and for the parents, because when you have a means-testing system, it means that all parents who want to access the service have to apply through a means-testing system. That is one of the differences between bursaries and means-testing, is that it is completely the reverse. Parents have to apply for a bursary, but most parents do not. In means-testing, everybody applies, so immediately the levels of administration in a means-testing system are many times that of a bursary system. It is also very intrusive. We at the moment have 2.5 members of staff to operate the means-testing system for universities, and there are a smaller number of applicants for universities than there are for the music service, so it is likely that to operate a means-testing system for a music service, we are going to need at least the same number of staff and probably more, and very quickly you would find that any cost savings through a means-testing system, the administrative costs would outweigh any savings very quickly, because you are talking about a service which is at a much lower level, there is much smaller amounts of money involved than there is in the university grants system. The form filling and red tape in a means-testing system would put off many parents, we believe, and it is not usual to have such a heavy-handed kind of administrative - I am talking about means-testing now - process for an extracurricular activity or a hobby. I mean, would you ask for means-testing for extra ballet lessons or gym lessons, because the instrumental music service falls into the same kind of category.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

But we do not provide gym or ballet lessons.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

No, you do not, but I am asking whether, if we were to provide free gym or free ... I am just trying to compare them.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

At the moment, you are proposing a type of means-testing, because you are means-testing the lowest 10 per cent and you have this income support system.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

That is a very easy form of means-testing.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

But surely it is more to do with information sharing between the partners. If you could base it on the tax return of the previous year, then you have the ability to access the information from income tax. That would be very simple.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

With income tax, that is exactly how we do. What we will be asking parents to do is to give us income tax forms for everybody who wants to access the service.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

So who funds the bursary? Sorry if I missed that. Is it funded by the States or is there private organisations giving the money?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

It is funded through the ...

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Through the scheme.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Through the budgeting, through the budget, so you do not have a major sponsorship, no, for the bursary. No.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Although who knows in the future, with an expanded service, there may well be situations where the private sector may want to offer bursaries for this, and I would not rule that out in the future. In fact, I think there are authorities where that does happen.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

What is this additional income you are talking about, £35,000? Where does the additional income come from?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Sorry, I am not quite sure what you are referring to.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

From your presentation; it is the third slide.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

That makes up the remainder of £165,000 of your £200,000 saving.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Yes. When we were looking at this, from when we were looking at how we would plug the gap initially, as it were, before expanding the service, the additional income and efficiency savings are obviously 2 parts of it.

[13:00]

The additional income would come from new services, so these would be new things that we would offer to schools or parents or whatever, and they do not make up the whole £35,000, they make up about £10,000 to £15,000 of that £35,000, so it is the additional income and efficiency savings that would come out of the £35,000.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

What are the efficiency savings?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

The efficiency savings would be around the way that we operate. Currently, because of the way that we are structured and because of the way that we do things, there is a lot of roles that we can take out if we are operating in a much more ... as I was saying before, the whole system is about not stopping access, but the whole system is about controlling access, because we do not have the resource. We can restructure in a way that would be much simpler to run and organise.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Is that a post that is going? No.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Okay, if I can take a step back there, going from the policy which the officer announced, which was the idea that by including a bursary system, what we are trying to do is have a policy whereby people should not be disadvantaged through lack of financial resources, if we look at the bursary

system, presumably it is being brought in because there is a realisation by the department that there is going to be a problem for those people who are just above the income support threshold that are in the middle, and now, as my colleague was touching upon, within that bursary system, there is no upper cap.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

There is.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Oh, can you please explain?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

There is, and we are still developing our plans on the bursary. We are aware that we need to get a move on with this and we are working hard at it. We have looked at several bursary kind of schemes that there are around. The only one that is perhaps the closest, bearing in mind what we are talking about, being an instrumental music service, is a bursary scheme which is in operation at one of the fee-paying schools. They do already have a bursary scheme for instrumental music in one of them, and so we are looking at that in some detail. It appears that the upper limit that would be appropriate is somewhere between late £30,000-ish, shall we say £37,500 to £40,000 household income, and we must bear in mind household income and probably £47,500 to £50,000, so somewhere between the late £30,000s to the late £40,000s in terms of household income would be the appropriate levels of income that this bursary will be available to, in addition to ... but there are several other factors that one takes into account on a bursary scheme, you know, the kind of involvement from parents, the recommendation of the music teachers, the recommendation of the school as to whether the pupil is likely to continue with this, the actual technical ability of the child that is showing. Graham, do you want to expand?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Yes, surely. I think in terms of operating a bursary, it is a very simple admin-light approach to household income, and I think we can ask for a financial statement signed off by the Tax Office that gives us a level of income for the family. I think that is quite easy to obtain. I think we can also ask for a letter of explanation as to why the parent feels that they need support or the family feel they need support. I think it is important that each one of these is taken case by case, that there is not a bunch of rules that mean we cannot be flexible.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

But is it not that which causes the problems? If it is discretionary and the more flexibility you have in it, surely that is when you get the appeals, that is when you got your Assistant Ministers ...

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

There will be guidelines.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

There has got to be rules.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

There has got to be guidelines.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

There has got to be rules, absolutely.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

We do not want them ...

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So it is not based on income support. Do you have to qualify for income support in order to get the bursary, but anyone who is on income support will qualify automatically?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Yes, automatically.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Income support is very simple, and nursery places has a similar thing at the moment. On application, you tick a box that says: "I am on income support" and that is checked with Social Security and that is it. They would then receive free lessons.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

That is the second kind of bursary-like scheme that we have a great deal of experience and knowledge of, which is the availability of free hours in the N.E.F. (Nursery Education Funding) scheme, the nursery ...

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Social Security can share that with you? As a parish, where Social Security are paying ... I know it is slightly changing the subject. Social Security pay a person on income support, they pay their rates. It is part of the income support, but we do not know as a parish that that person is on income support, so how does Education know, from a totally different department, that you're sharing information with a different department?

**Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

That has been agreed between the 2 chief officers, 2 departments and obviously ...

**Executive Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

The parents give permission on this.

**Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

... the parents give permission that that be shared with us, because it has obviously an impact on them.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So you could do that same thing with the Tax Office as well. You have said it is not onerous. If you wanted to introduce a top cap on anyone over £100,000 per family income: "We do not subsidise you at all. Go and do your own thing."

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Parents will apply to us for a bursary and we will say: "Okay. Could you please give us ... and these are the guidelines. It is unlikely that you will get a bursary if your income levels are in excess of £47,500, £47,000. That is where we are pitching it at the moment, but we will need some proof of that, so give us your tax form."

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

But not everyone up to £47,000 will be entitled automatically to bursaries.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

No.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

No.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

So where is the grey area? How does it work between income support and £47,000?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

We will take several ... we have 100-ish bursaries to award and we will look at all sorts of other things that fall into the same ... that will have an influence on it, the number of children in the household, the performance of the children so far, their attitude for playing an instrument, music. I

do not know; there could be several things. It could be a musical background in the family, there was sibling that already plays.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

But that basis could be used up straight away from income support payments. You will not have ...

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

No, no.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

No, that is not part of it.

**Executive Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

In addition to.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

That is in addition, so we have everybody who is on income support gets it free.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Automatically free lessons.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

There will be an additional 100 bursaries available for those that are not on income support but are in a lower-income category between income support levels. They range. It depends on the family circumstances where the family incomes are for income support, but it is approximately £30,000 I think is the general feeling.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Just on that, given that this particular ... although this, I understand, has to have States approval and it is for the principle of the charging mechanism, I appreciate that, Minister, when talking about the bursary system, which of course will be used to get a lot of States Members in order to support the scheme, you said: "It could be this, it could be that." It sounds to me like there is still a lot of work to be done on the bursary scheme.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

We still do need to some work and we are working hard at it now.



**Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

But there is a key principle. The key principle is that if by levying the charges it creates a barrier to accessing the instrument individual tuition, then that is the key principle for the bursary, is that you do not want any system which bars any child because of the difference between the charges now and there is a free service.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Just one more question. I know it is fairly complex. Are we saying that everybody on income support who applies for the music service will automatically get a place or will they still have to make the other criteria? So ...

**Male Speaker:**

Other criteria in terms of assessment for the instrument?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Yes.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

I think this is about the expansion. The world I want to see is where if a child wants to learn to play an instrument, they get that opportunity, where we are not saying: "We will take you and we will not take you." So there may be a transition period where we have got to gear up to be able to do that, but yes, anybody that ticks the box would get a lesson once we get everything running properly, because anybody that wants a lesson would get a lesson, because it is not about selecting children out, it is about bringing children in.

**Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

It is the culture that Graham explained earlier.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Yes.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

You want to get rid of the ... you will not have waiting lists any more.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

That is right. The idea is that any child that wants to access the system will be able to. If it is helpful - it may take a few seconds to explain it - there are 3 admission schemes that are part of this. There is the access to music, which means that any family that is on income support will

automatically qualify for no fees. There is the sibling discounts, which means anybody with more than one child in the system, the first child will pay the full price.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Although they are not huge.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Well, they are 10 per cent and 15 per cent, but again, they could apply for a bursary on the grounds that they have several children in and they are only just above social security payments, so that would be another ground for the bursary, and then the bursary itself, and the 100 places represents, on current figures, 10 per cent of pupils, so it is quite a large bursary package there.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

I think it is also true to say that we are not ... it is hard to know exactly how this will work out with bursaries. It really is quite difficult to ... you have got to do a lot of guesswork, frankly. The department is in a position of having to do quite a lot of guesswork, educated guesswork. We have done as much research as we can, but there are not too many models that we can look at. We can look at our nursery scheme, we can look at other schemes for music service that there are - there is only one locally - and that we have access to finding out how it works. So what we will have to do is review it after one year, we will have to look at the bursary scheme and look at how successful it is and what the problems are with it and review it after one year, so we will do that.

**Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

The Minister has made that commitment within the paper.

## **What consultation has taken place?**

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

As you have raised it, I will go on to it now. As you have said, Minister, this proposal has been floating around for quite some time now and although you touched upon your research, can you explain to us what consultation was had with the 2 particular key groups, parents and teachers?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Okay. I will let Graham and his 2 officers explain who has been talking to whom.

**Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

The consultation period, I think you are talking a couple of years' time, because this was part of the initial C.S.R. proposals we put forward to the States late 2010, and through that process there

was opportunity for consultation. Exact details, I apologise, I would have to go back and get the exact process in terms of who was consulted at that time.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

If you could make that available to us, we would appreciate that, thank you.

**Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

Because we did go through a process of ... I know exactly the meetings we held with the schools, with head teachers. There was a clear consultation within our own service. In terms of the consultation with the parents support group, I will get those exact details.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

We have kept parents involved, informed all the way along of the process that was happening and the ideas that were floating out. I have written to parents specifically on this matter 3 times this year, I think certainly twice since September, on what is going on, and on each occasion have said that any comments could be directed to me personally.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

That is the parents of children ...

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Children already in the system, yes, that is right. That is not ... yes, yes. In terms of staff consultation, the staff have been aware of this for a while. We have had several discussions around their views on it, their concerns about it, how they see things shaping up. I think it would be dishonest of me to pretend that the staff would not be concerned by something like this, because it is a huge change and it is the way the service has operated for a long time, but they are certainly aware that these things are being talked about. In fact, they know I am here today, because the last staff meeting I told them I was going to be here, so they are aware of the process and we have talked to them about it a lot.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Going back to the parent consultation which you said you have had, can you explain what had been the key concerns that had been raised with you, or with the department, I should say?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Yes. To be absolutely frank, we have not had a lot of contact from parents. I have had several phone calls really seeking clarification on what is meant by it. I have had 2 parents saying that they would have to withdraw their child if we went down this route, but I did say to them that that is

not the purpose of this and that: "Please come and talk to me and I am sure we can resolve this issue." Interestingly, I do not personally have to deal with all the parents that are disappointed, the children that are disappointed each year, but obviously if there is a particular issue or a parent that is not satisfied with the answer they are given, eventually it ends up on my desk. I spoke directly to 2 or 3 parents last year that were upset because their children could not access the service, and in each of those conversations, without any steer from me, got to the point where they were saying: "Well, if we all paid a bit towards it, perhaps more of us could access the system." So I think many parents have contacts in the U.K. and this sort of thing has been in the U.K. for 15 years. I think people are aware of it, and I think it would be fair to say with staff and parents, there are genuine concerns and genuine fears, but I am not sure that people are too resistant to it.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

I am just conscious of time. Do you have any final questions?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Yes. If the point of this is to try and be comprehensive, and I appreciate it is a quid pro quo obviously, and in an ideal world - in my ideal world - that the parents would not have to pay anything and we would have centralised funding for it, but the idea is to make it more comprehensive and make the access better, will that be able to be extended to De La Salle and Beaulieu?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Yes.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Is there any reason that cannot be done straight away?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

It will be done in September 2013.

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

It could be a new service. Because it would be new services, it could be, yes.

[13:15]

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

It just follows on then if you present this to the States with that thickness, it will attract lots of questions from Members that we have been asking here today and it may risk a reference back,

so would it be worth considering the great detail that States Members will want maybe as an additional appendix to circulate and the final details of the Business Plan? I think that would be ...

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

We would welcome Scrutiny's input on this. You are doing a lot of work now presumably with this meeting and no doubt you will be generating some comments and things, but yes, we can ... the idea is not to starve States Members of the detail.

**Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

Yes, the supplementary information around the area you questioned about.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Like you said, it will be asked for if it is not there. As I say, if we have asked, other States Members will ask for it.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

A copy of the transcript from this hearing will be very useful in that respect, and if there are other comments that you would like to make on where you think we are light on detail, please furnish us with it and we will supply that.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Yes, that is what I said. I think quite early on in today's hearing, it is about user-pays and I think it would be quite helpful for other States Members to have a list of what other user charges there are at present.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Within our department or within all departments.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

No, no. Not every one, but examples in the Island where users pay for services albeit, as you said, subsidised, I understand.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Yes, things that happen, extracurricular in schools, for example. I think that is fairly easy to do, other extracurricular activities that take place for young children, gym clubs, dancing classes.

**Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

It is an addition and the majority of those providers are external to our department as well, so we can let you know what happens outside of the curriculum time. Obviously all the other aspects of the curriculum are statutory and they are funded fully.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

The £110,000, because of the delay, the lost money, does that cause the department a problem? Do you have to make that up now?

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

I mean, I do not want to give you the impression that it is not a problem, but I do not want to give the impression that it is a problem either. With a department with a budget of £120 million, I think ... we are currently covering the expenditure that has been removed from our budget via other means, by being careful in other areas and saving a few bob here and there to cover the music service in what they need in the short term. That is why we would emphasise that we do need to get the charges in place for 2013, otherwise it will start to become a bigger problem.

**Senior Officer, Education, Sport and Culture:**

It was a planned-for cost in this year's budget. We knew we had to meet that cost.

**The Connétable of St. Martin:**

I think the music service, just generally as a comment, and the Education Department, should congratulate the young people, because I think music and young people, they are representatives of the Island and we continually see in the media how they have done so well. I wish I could play something, but I think you should be congratulated.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Before we close, one final question from me. I just want to get a better understanding from the department in broadening the service and providing different instruments that pupils will be able to gain - which is one of the benefits of this, supposedly - what assessment has there been of the availability of different teachers within the Island to be able to provide those different services?

**Head of Service, Jersey Music Service:**

Good question. I think the Minister touched on it earlier, where we said we can expand depending on what talent pool we have got to draw on. As this has become closer and closer to a decision being made, we have started collecting information about private teachers that are on the Island and what is available. We have also started looking to some of the private music schools, schools like Jenco that teach guitar and drums and that sort of thing, about whether we could go into

partnership with them to deliver those particular types of teaching. We are slowly finding people on the Island that are qualified to teach, but there is no opportunity. They are doing other things. So we are slowly building up a picture. I think it is fair to say that if it expands in the way that we would like it to, we may struggle a bit, but that is probably a nice problem to have.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Thank you. In that case, before I close, I offer the Minister and the department, if there are any other comments that they want to make or anything they want to clarify, that opportunity now.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

I think we have covered everything, thank you, Deputy.

**Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

In which case, may I thank you for attending here today and I am sure, as always - the opportunity is there - if we have anything further we will approach you.

**The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:**

Thank you.

[13:20]